

FAS Senate

AN ELECTED BODY OF THE FACULTY OF ARTS AND
SCIENCES
YALE UNIVERSITY

FAS Senate Meeting
September 17, 2020
3:30 PM – 5:30 PM Via Zoom
Minutes – DRAFT

Present: Matthew Jacobson, Steven Wilkinson, Sybil Alexandrov, David Bercovici, Howard Bloch, Nicholas Christakis, Aimee Cox, Emily Erikson, Marta Figlerowicz, Joseph Fischel, John Geanakoplos, Miki Havlickova, Valerie Horsley, Jennifer Klein, Timothy Newhouse, William Nordhaus, Ruzica Piskac, Kathryn Slanski, Meg Urry, Paul Van Tassel

Rose Rita Riccitelli, Staff

Absent: Alessandro Gomez, H  l  ne Landemore

Guests: there were approximately 100 FAS faculty guests

CHAIR’S INTRODUCTION:

The first meeting of the 2020/21 academic year of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences Senate (FASS) took place on Thursday, September 17, 2020. The meeting was called to order at 3:30 PM by Chair **Matthew Jacobson**. **Mr. Jacobson** noted that there are three important documents that the FASS released in June 2020 that he plans to redistribute to faculty as a reminder of their importance. The first, he said, is a statement of principles: *Preserving the Future of Yale’s Research and Teaching Mission during Financial Crises*. **Mr. Jacobson** said that we find ourselves facing an extraordinary moment, and that COVID-19 has presented formidable social, financial, and health challenges to the Yale community with the full extent yet to be unknown. He noted that we are fortunate that Yale has systems, procedures, and resources in place to confront profound financial disruptions – just as it has done in the past on multiple occasions, and stressed that in times of change, challenge, and uncertainty, decision-making at a historic institution such as Yale, with rich legacies from a long past and high expectations for a long future, should be guided by fundamental principles, which we affirm here: (1) to protect the mission of the university, (2) to maintain excellence at Yale for the future, (3) to preserve institutional stability, and (4) to protect the vulnerable, all through (5) shared governance. He said that these principles define the FAS Senate’s work for this year and thanked senators for their hard work. He noted that there are also two important budget reports - one on Yale’s spending rules and one on the lessons to be gleaned from past crises, and he encouraged everyone to revisit each of these three reports in advance of the upcoming Provost’s open forum that is scheduled on September

24th, and said he will send a message to all faculty and include links to these three documents before the Provost's forum. **Mr. Jacobson** mentioned overhanging issues that have been put aside since we have been dealing with the COVID crisis:

- 1) The formation of a committee on Yale-NUS to study issues of freedom expression. That committee has been composed, but its activities derailed.
- 2) The Divestment Initiative - noting that after our FASS Divestment meeting last year, the FASS wrote a letter to President Salovey conveying our recommendation that a committee be set up by the President to review and revise the longstanding statement on ethical investing, noting that this also has been derailed by COVID. However, Yale's General Counsel Alex Dreier is working to constitute a university-wide committee to look into this question and hopes to appoint and charge the committee within the next few weeks.
- 3) Proposed University Mission Statement – we have not received a formal response, however the FAS Steering Committee has taken up the question and will keep us posted as they figure out the next steps.

COMMITTEE REPORTS:

FASS Science and Engineering Committee:

Mr. Jacobson introduced **Paul Van Tassel**, chair of the FASS Science and Engineering Committee, to provide an update on the committee's goals for the coming year. **Mr. Van Tassel** said that the committee's goal is to promote faculty input and self-governance in matters of FAS science and engineering, and to focus on the implementation of science priorities as outlined in the 2018 University Science Strategy Committee's (USSC) report. He noted that the FASS Science and Engineering Committee is meeting with **Michael Crair**, the Vice Provost for Research, on September 23rd to discuss these goals. Also, he said, short-term matters will be addressed by committee members **Meg Urry** and **Valerie Horsley**, with **Ms. Urry** focusing on the International science postdoc crisis and **Ms. Horsley** addressing the supplemental funding gap in the biological sciences. He said both matters speak to communication between faculty and the administration. The committee will send a letter to the Provost, and they will also coordinate with other science bodies at Yale - the Science and Engineering Chairs' Council (Chair Karsten Heeger) and the Science, Engineering and Applied Science (SEAS) Strategic Planning Committee.

FASS Committee on Instructional Faculty and Academic Support

Mr. Jacobson introduced **Sybil Alexandrov** to report on the FASS Committee on Instructional Faculty and Academic Support. **Ms. Alexandrov** noted that we are about to complete week 3 of the semester, however it is not our third week on the job. Since last March, she noted, many faculty members, including a great number of instructional faculty, have dedicated countless hours to retooling to prepare for online teaching. She noted the number of participants in workshops at the *Poorvu Center* and the *Center for Language Study*, as well as the other outside opportunities, speaks to the desire to maintain high standards in teaching in this new environment. She said that the members of the FASS Committee on Instructional Faculty and

Academic Support – **Marta Figlerowicz, Miki Havlickova, Joseph Fischel, Kathryn Slanski** and herself, have begun to outline the committee’s priorities for the year. Some items are:

- Contract Renewal/reappointment
- Service load
- Career path options
- Compensation
- Parental leave

She noted that several of these issues are not new, and she looks forward to the day when they do not appear on the agenda. She said that the reappointment process continues to remain vague in certain cases and we would like the administration to provide clarity in the procedure, transparency in the process, and timely communication. Regarding the service load, she said that it is essential that there be clear expectations of equitable distribution and reasonable limits to service. Regarding career paths, she would like to open the discussion of a tenure equivalent for instructional faculty. She noted that the University of California system has a “Lecturer with Security of Employment” that might serve as a model. Regarding compensation, **Ms. Alexandrov** said that in the 2017 *FASS Report on the Status, Pay and Condition of Non-Ladder Faculty*, the FASS recommended a review of non-ladder salaries in FAS and the introduction of a program of structural adjustments and more robust merit raises for non-ladder faculty, and neither of these have been adequately addressed. She said that Yale embraces equity, however the absence of an increase in salary is felt much more deeply by those who earn \$60K than by those who make twice, three, or four times as much, and also how it affects a single-income parent. Regarding parental leave, she said we maintain that it should be the same for all faculty at Yale, regardless of rank.

FASS Budget Committee:

Mr. Geanakoplos was introduced to present a report on the Budget Committee. He began by noting that the FASS produced three documents at the end of last year about the budget in the time of COVID and that the Budget Committee intends to follow up on those reports this year. He said that nothing unites the faculty more than the desire for faculty and university excellence and that two years ago, the FASS issued its *Faculty Excellence Report*, which documented three important discoveries connecting Faculty Excellence and the budget. The first finding, he said, was that the faculty themselves, 500 of whom responded to our survey, were worried about Yale’s rank among leading research universities. Just 1.8% of the faculty thought their own departments were clearly number one in the country. He noted that this Excellence Deficit (relative to our aspirations), has just recently gotten more confirmation from the *US News and World Report* ranking undergraduate Colleges. For the first time since the report began, Yale College has fallen out of the top three and is now ranked tied for fourth and fifth. **Mr. Geanakoplos** said that the *Faculty Excellence Report* also documented the twin faculty Compensation Deficits, in salaries and size, and that according to AAUP data, Yale FAS full professor salaries were 8% higher than our most important competitors in 1970, and now after a decade of decline are 13% behind those same peers and the size of the FAS relative to our peers fell by about 15%. He noted that the FASS was gratified to hear last year that the Provost and the Dean each acknowledged the deficits and both supported reducing the twin deficits. **Mr. Geanakoplos** noted that now in 2020 we have the best opportunity we may ever see in our

lifetimes because many universities will not be able to hire faculty this year and many universities will not be taking graduate students this year, and that Yale can. He said that some may think it is harder to recruit now because Yale is facing Financial Dangers and Losses from COVID, and he applauds the amazing energy shown by the Provost and the Deans in these most trying conditions. He said that he is proud of Yale for inviting so many students back and really leading the way in the Ivy League. But he said that the COVID financial losses should not affect our recruiting because Yale is not like NYU, or Berkeley - NYU relies on current revenues from tuition to finance current expenditures and Berkeley relies on current state transfers, while Yale has a huge endowment, like almost nobody else. He noted that Yale has a longstanding plan for dealing with financial crises that was created by the greatest macro-finance economist in the world - James Tobin and his Yale disciples, and has been imitated across the country, and it recognizes the advantages Yale has from a huge endowment and from a brilliant endowment manager. **Mr. Geanakoplos** noted that the FASS explained this plan in three documents last year, and in short, the plan says that in the face of a financial crisis, STAY the COURSE - stay the course at least until we find out how bad things really are. He noted that most financial crises look scarier than they turn out to be and that things very often return to normal. Stay the course because abrupt changes are unnecessarily damaging. He said that freezing hiring in midstream loses candidates and time and cannot be made up by hiring twice as fast later when things turn around. Stay the Course because the fundamental principle of Long-Term Sustainability, which is the mission of the Yale endowment manager, is to leave every generation equally well off. That means the current generation does not have the right to disproportionately consume windfall gains (say from alumni contributions) but also it means the current generation should not be crushed by bad luck, such as from COVID. Gains and losses must be spread across all generations. **Mr. Geanakoplos** noted that the COVID losses so far come to around \$250 million, including last year and so far this year. That is about equal to the average DAILY fluctuation in the value of the Yale endowment. He said that we would never impose a dramatic reduction in spending one year because of one day's average drop in the endowment, and yet Yale announced a pause or freeze in salaries and a pause or freeze in hiring. He said that Yale's Dean of the Graduate School recommended that all graduate schools consider pausing admissions, i.e., suspending admissions for one year, and doing so she said would be a sign of strength, not weakness. He noted that some departments like Art History have followed her advice and renounced new graduate students this coming year. Some faculty are worried that the administration has confused staying the course with pausing. **Mr. Geanakoplos** said that we will never have a better opportunity to hire faculty or to get the best graduate students, and that Yale is moving backward on all the elements of faculty excellence that just a year ago we resolved to advance, just when it has its biggest opportunity. He said that even if the losses that were feared had materialized, these cuts would be contrary to the Yale's carefully thought out plan of staying the course. But the losses so far are much less than feared. The market did not collapse, donors did not go broke, and the Yale Hospital is back to performing colonoscopies. He said that we are hopeful that the administration recognizes all this and that next week our Provost will tell us that we are staying the course, and not freezing hiring or cutting it in half. He noted, as the great business leader Jack Welch said, you can judge a manager best by how he or she creates opportunities in a down cycle. And, he said, whatever the Provost says, we need to understand the reasons for his decision and that the permanent officers have a right to know. He said that the

administration will gain by sharing its thinking with at least some faculty because they will gain more cooperation and may even learn something from the conversation that will help them to make good decisions. He said that almost all our competitors have significant faculty committees that advise the Dean of FAS and the provost and that he is in regular touch with the Harvard committee, which is chaired by a Yale PhD macro-finance expert, and that these faculty committees do not always advocate spending more, even more on faculty, and that they are responsible and valuable contributors to difficult decisions. At Harvard, he said, they helped advise Harvard to spend less because it had gone beyond its spending rule in previous years and many of the cuts we see now at Harvard had been agreed on before COVID in conjunction with faculty committees. **Mr. Geanakoplos** said that we on the budget committee do propose that the FASS set up some kind of regular and substantive dialogue with the Provost and Dean of FAS about the budget.

FASS COVID Crisis Committee:

Mr. Jacobson introduced **Emily Erikson** to report on the COVID-19 Crisis Committee. She said that several concerns arose over the summer, in particular about whether the University had an adequate strategy for a sudden rise in cases and whether enough testing is in place and required to keep faculty and graduate students safe as well as undergraduates. She noted that meetings with the administration have consistently indicated that the University has engaged in careful and thorough preparations, however there does seem to be a problem with communicating that information to the faculty in a trusted manner. The committee, she said, has resolved to focus on two issues. 1) in the short term, suggestions for improved messaging 2) long-term planning issues, i.e. how will COVID play out in the spring, 2021, and beyond.

FASS Governance Committee:

Governance Committee Report on Yale Copyright in the Digital Age

Mr. Jacobson introduced **William Nordhaus** from the FASS Governance Committee who offered an overview of the committee's Copyright Report

He noted that the *Woodward Report on Freedom of Expression at Yale* begins with the following: "The primary function of a university is to discover and disseminate knowledge by means of research and teaching. To fulfill this function a free interchange of ideas is necessary not only within its walls but with the world beyond as well. It follows that the university must do everything possible to ensure within it the fullest degree of intellectual freedom."

Mr. Nordhaus noted that one of the means of achieving this aim is to provide faculty the widest latitude on their intellectual activities, and this involves freedom to create new and independent works, to control their expression and use, and to benefit both financially and more important reputationally from the ownership and control of their academic activities. These outputs, he said, include books and articles; works of fiction and nonfiction; poems and dramatic works; musical and choreographic works; pictorial, graphic, and sculptural works; lecture notes and courseware; and in the modern era, digital works such as recordings. He said that artists, writers, and scholars achieve protection primarily by copyright, and that copyright conveys the exclusive right of the owner to copy or reproduce, revise, distribute, perform, and display the work for a limited period of time. He explained that the objective of copyright is, in the words of the U.S.

Constitution, to “To promote the progress of science and useful arts, by securing for limited times to authors and inventors the exclusive right to their respective writings and discoveries.”

Mr. Nordhaus noted that most of us have given little thought to the issues of copyright, and have taken them for granted, and there were exceptions for those of us who prepared online courses, such as for Coursera, but those had special agreements. He said that the FASS, through its Governance Committee and Executive Council, has been involved with this issue since last spring when we moved to remote teaching, and we are grateful to many people for their advice. He noted that he particularly wants to thank Lisa Alter (YLS and Alter, Kendrick & Baron), Amy Prof. Kapczynski (YLS, expert copyright law), Ian Ayres, Jon Soderstrom. However, he noted, we are now faced with what is called a “disruptive technology” in education. The combination of high-speed and high-bandwidth communication and the shutdowns of the pandemic are creating overnight a new model for teaching and learning. We faculty, he said, are on the front lines of the disruptive technology, and we have worked all summer to create remote courses using this disruptive technology. **Mr. Nordhaus** said that the key question for the future of higher education is: Who will own and control these new works? Who will benefit, reputationally and financially, from these courses? He shared how he sometimes thinks of a lecture: It is a one-act play, written, produced, directed, and acted by a member of our faculty, usually for one performance for an exceptionally talented audience of students. He said if we want the best lectures, then the creator of those one-act plays must control their development, production, and use, as well as benefit from their excellence, and that is the central argument behind the need to ensure that faculty have the ownership of their teaching materials as well as their scholarly materials.

Mr. Nordhaus then gave a background on copyright: the 1976 Copyright Act

We operate under the rules set by the US Copyright Act of 1976. Under that law, copyrights are generally owned by the people who create the works of expression. An exception is that the employer owns the work if it was a work made for hire. “A “work made for hire is ... a work prepared by an employee within the scope of his or her employment.” It is under that doctrine that universities claim that scholarly and teaching materials are work made for hire.

The question of the “professorial exception”

Prior to the 1976 Act, there was a widely held view of a “teacher exception.” That is, teachers were thought to be exempt from the work for hire category because of the unique nature of their creative work. Universities generally do not accept the teacher exception, while the AAUP holds that the teacher exception continues to apply. While there are some lingering questions, it seems unlikely that it will be litigated to the higher court in the near future.

The best way to settle the issue is for the faculty and the university to agree on a set of rules in the digital age that will provide the best climate for scholarly and pedagogical innovation. And for the most part, this would be to agree that faculty owns the rights to their scholarly and pedagogical works. We must therefore rely on rules on copyright

ownership that are agreed upon by the University and its faculty. That is the purpose of the proposal that we present today.

Mr. Nordhaus said that in researching Yale's current copyright policy, he came across a new policy recently written and put into practice that he and his colleagues had no knowledge of. When he looked into when and how it came into practice, he could not find a date nor the author of this policy – just another example of the administration taking action on an important issue without the knowledge or input of its faculty. He said that he and the members of the FASS Governance Committee prepared the *Report on the Copyright Issue in the Digital Age* and asked the FASS to review it for their approval and distribution to FAS Faculty and the administration.

Mr. Jacobson called for questions from senators and guests on this report before the motion for approval was made. **Ms. Erikson** asked whether the committee thought about the second-order consequences of their recommendations. Specifically, while she agrees that faculty should have rights to their teaching materials, videos included, she is concerned about fostering a new environment in which classes migrate away from university settings, with adverse consequences for universities and teaching standards, which would also ultimately impact faculty and science and the accumulation of knowledge. **Mr. Nordhaus** replied that the committee's focus has been on the present issue created by COVID and the switch to on-line teaching. **Ms. Erikson** said that she hopes that any future committee will also carefully consider this important issue.

Mr. Nordhaus then made a motion to vote on acceptance of the committee's report as presented.

Ms. Horsley seconded the motion. A vote was taken, and it was unanimous that the FASS accepted the *Report on the Copyright Issue in the Digital Age* by the FASS Governance Committee.

DISCUSSION WITH UNIVERSITY LIBRARIAN

Mr. Jacobson introduced **Barbara Rockenbach**, the new University Librarian. **Ms. Rockenbach** noted that the Library's *Strategic Directions* and *Community Values* were established over the past two years to provide a framework for the work of the library and they have been especially important since the start of the pandemic as the library's efforts have been focused on supporting the needs of faculty and students for remote teaching, research, and learning. She said with the transition of leadership in the library on July 1, 2020, these *Strategic Directions* and *Community Values* have been reaffirmed and will provide a framework for the work of the library in the coming year. She pointed to several initiatives:

Strengthening the online library experience

- Faculty and students can now view online only search results quickly due to new functionality implemented this spring in *Quicksearch*.
- Faculty and students can use *EZProxy* to access most e-resources off-campus from the library's website without being required to log into the virtual private network (VPN). This simplifies and improves the user experience of using online resources.
- The library has increased collection materials available online through licensing, purchasing, and digitization to support remote teaching and learning.
- Library instruction, workshops, and statistical support services are offered online-only this semester. Consultations with research librarians are virtual, except when special

circumstances – such as a need to consult physical materials – require an in-person meeting.

- We are temporarily prioritizing e-book purchases over prioritizing e-book purchases to ensure that users on campus and off campus have the same access to the same materials.
- The library has secured emergency access to e-books via the HathiTrust digital library through the end of the fall semester. As a condition of this access, our print copies of these titles may not be checked out, but they are available for chapter scan requests through Scan and Deliver.
- The Ask Yale Library service has expanded hours to provide synchronous live chat sessions for questions.
- The library now provides a streaming video service for courses that need to screen films.

Accommodating physical access to collections

- Delivery to mailing addresses and campus delivery to residential colleges and graduate dormitory housing is now available for faculty, staff, and students who do not have access to campus or who prefer not to come into the library.
- Library staff have returned to campus to process the print materials acquired since March.
- Many special collections staff are back on campus to digitize materials for fall classes and will also provide in-class material handling demonstrations and object engagements via Zoom. Yale researchers can now make appointments to see special collections materials.

Reopening spaces to faculty and students

All libraries are open as of August 31 -- Bass Library, the Cushing/Whitney Medical Library, the Divinity Library, Gilmore Music Library, Haas Arts Library, Marx Science and Social Science Library (formerly CSSI), and Sterling Memorial Library -- to current faculty, graduate and professional students, and undergraduates in residence who have completed their initial quarantine period.

- Opening hours are limited, and some spaces within the libraries will remain closed to comply with health and safety guidelines. The contact-free pickup service that operated this summer in the Thain Café has moved to Sterling Nave.
- We are hiring students as Library Ambassadors to encourage their fellow students to comply with the health and safety guidelines such as wearing face coverings at all times while in the library and keeping six feet of distance from other library users.
- Please see our Library Reopening FAQ for information about the precautions we are taking to create a safe and welcoming environment.

Student Library Advisory Committee

We established a Student Library Advisory Committee to give students an active voice in library-related issues on campus. The Student Library Advisory Committee will be a two-way forum for information exchange between students and the library. Meetings will be scheduled twice per

semester during the Fall and Spring academic terms. The committee will cover topics such as inclusive art in the library, student well-being, the library website, and how we can best support students in the time of COVID.

Selected Noteworthy Library Acquisitions in FY20

Electronic Resources

To address the particular needs of remote teaching and learning due to the pandemic, the library initiated a spring 2020 project to acquire more ebook packages to meet increased need. These are new additions to the library's already robust collection of ebooks. New packages included:

- Routledge Handbooks 2020
 - MIT Press 2020
 - Cambridge Classical Studies 2020
 - Cambridge UP 2018-2019
 - Harvard University Asia Center E-Book Collection (Brill)
- Working directly with publishers and through library consortia to secure price freezes or reductions for 2021. In some cases, publishers and vendors have been proactive, recognizing library budget constraints. Successes thus far include Wiley, JSTOR, Science and other AAAS publications, Annual Reviews, SciFinder (Chemical Abstracts Service), Oxford UP journals and databases, and more.
 - Increased streaming video content available, not only in packages like Docuseek, Academic Video Online, and Digitalia Film Library, but also individual titles from distributors such as Women Make Movies, Cinematix (Mumbai), and ArtMattan (which distributes “films that focus on the human experience of people of color all over the world”).

Ms. Rockenbach said that she is happy to have had the opportunity to address the FASS and looks forward to returning in the future, and also stressed that if anyone has any questions or concerns regarding the library, that she is always available to address them.

STATEMENT ON CHILDCARE POLICY

Mr. Jacobson introduced **Melissa Barton** to offer a statement on the *Childcare Policy* from the Yale *Working Women's Network*. **Ms. Barton** thanked **Mr. Jacobson** for inviting her to share her story and said that she is a curator at Beinecke Library and the parent of two children, aged 5 and 11 months, and is speaking on behalf of an ad-hoc group formed from members of the *Working Women's Network*, a staff affinity group. She noted that Yale's staff have been working full-time throughout the pandemic in the midst of an acute childcare crisis, and we have petitioned Yale for robust, innovative solutions, but so far the administration's proposals are not scalable. Instead, she said, they force parents to find and compete for limited childcare resources, with each family cobbling together their own workarounds day-to-day. She reported that the group has recommended a series of actions, including the following:

1. Convene an emergency task force comprising staff and faculty parents, affinity groups, and Yale's world-class experts to create a comprehensive accommodation policy – one that is race, gender, and disability-informed – for caregivers.
2. Provide managers with detailed guidance for flexibility during the pandemic, focusing on output rather than hours.
3. Provide staff with unlimited COVID-related sick days to accommodate the inevitability that they or their dependents will be forced to quarantine.
4. Continue and augment direct financial support for unforeseen childcare costs during the pandemic. As it stands, the 20 days of reimbursement offered by Yale don't come close to covering the 130 staff working days since the pandemic began, or the many more to come.
5. Provide enhanced financial support, expertise, and resources to Greater New Haven childcare centers and schools as they make and adjust reopening plans.

Ms. Barton noted that the present situation is impracticable, inequitable, and unsustainable, and has put undue strain on us and our families and placed many Yale staff members and their families in impossible positions. And, she said, it obviously affects faculty too, as well as postdocs and graduate students, and by many measures, parents of children under 18 make up approximately 1/3 of the American work force. She noted that we all just want to be able to do our jobs while keeping our families safe, and we thank the FASS for your time and attention.

Valerie Horsley, who has been working on this issue since she arrived at Yale, responded by saying that Yale is stepping up their initiatives on Child Care and the situation is getting better and hopefully will continue to get better in the near future, with spaces in buildings now being identified as childcare spaces, and increased financial support for the costs to families being increased, at least for the time of the COVID crisis.

YALE PRISON AND EDUCATION PROGRAM PRESENTATION

Mr. Jacobson introduced **Zelda Roland**, Founding Director of the *Yale Prison Education Initiative* (YPEI) to speak to the FASS on the importance of the program and ask that FASS support this initiative. Ms. Roland began by giving the FASS an overview and history of YPEI, noted that YPEI was founded officially in 2016 as a program of Dwight Hall, Yale's Center for Public Service and Social Justice, and has expanded upon decades of informal faculty participation in prison education. She said that we have built on this foundation by offering access to real, rigorous, credit-bearing Yale courses to a select number of incarcerated students in our state, and offered our first classes in 2018 marking the first time that any incarcerated student has ever earned real, transferable credit on Yale transcripts. At MacDougall-Walker Correctional Institution in Suffield (a level 4/5 high/maximum security adult state prison) and the largest prison in the Northeast (with a population of 1500 people), she said that *600 people* asked to be considered for admission to Yale's first 12-person seminar, English 120 (Reading & Writing the Modern Essay) — demonstrating the interest in and urgent need for this program — and we have consistently only had the capacity to admit ~2% of applicants. Since then, she said, we have facilitated 81 unique enrollments in Yale classes for 32 incarcerated students — for example classes in Sociology, English, Latin, Art — in addition to not-for-credit programming and workshops that are offered year-round, and regular visiting guest lectures we host with faculty from every division at Yale.

However, **Ms. Roland** noted, we have only been allowed to do this work within the constraints of a very limited pilot, approved in 2018 by the Provost's office — which waived tuition for incarcerated students, and through a special arrangement with Yale College and Yale Summer Session on the condition that we raise all funds for YPEI and all of its courses independently through Dwight Hall (which we have done). Nevertheless, she said, within the constraints of this pilot, and in a few short years, YPEI has positioned Yale as a national leader in the movement for higher education in prison. We are among two Ivies to award institutional credit for courses taken inside a prison, and faculty and graduate students who teach are offered fair compensation at on campus rates.

She noted that we have only offered classes through this pilot that:

- are existing Yale/Yale Summer Session classes, approved by the Course of Study Committee;
- are taught by faculty and graduate students who are eligible to teach on campus; and
- that always maintain the rigor, expectations, academic standards, and structure as their on-campus counterparts.

She said that we also carve out unstructured study hall time and space for peer tutoring and office hours, and have added academic support programming for our students, such as “Academic Strategies” workshops in partnership with the Poorvu Center, and a growing number of partnerships that expose our students to the breadth of offerings at Yale.

In creating this rigorous program that brings the best of Yale resources to students who have been impacted by mass incarceration and who disproportionately come from black and brown communities in our region, and from the disenfranchised and overpoliced neighborhoods that border our very campus, she noted that we have amazingly solidified Yale's leadership in this growing field and provided significant leverage and incentive for peer institutions who are currently working to build or strengthen their own higher education in prison programs, and have made an outsized impact even with our tiny pilot with a deeply insignificant annual operating budget.

Ms. Roland noted that given the success of our program to date and our ambition to continue if not expand, in Fall 2019 the Dean of Yale College Marvin Chun appointed and charged an Ad Hoc Committee to review YPEI and consider the future of prison education at Yale, and the committee, which was chaired by Dean George Levesque, presented its final report to the faculty meeting of Yale College on April 28 of this year (that report is available for circulation).

Ms. Roland shared the four recommendations made by that committee:

Recommendation #1: That YPEI be authorized to pursue a prison education partnership with another institution for the purposes of offering courses, credits, and even degrees through a partner.

Recommendation #2: That the partnership agreement allow Yale instructors (faculty and graduate students) to teach through YPEI and this new partnership during the academic year.

Recommendation #3: That the Dean of Yale College or the University Provost appoint a faculty committee to oversee the academic components of this partnership.

Recommendation #4: That the current arrangement of offering courses through Yale Summer Session continue.

Ms. Roland read the conclusion of the committee’s report:

“The committee believes there is much that Yale can give to prison education, and also much that Yale can gain from prison education. Students in the program experience the transformative power of a liberal education that otherwise would be unavailable to them. Faculty who have taught in the program report that they experience their course material in new ways and notice reverberations back to their teaching at Yale. Several members of the faculty also have significant scholarly interest in the causes and consequences of incarceration, as well as in the value of prison education in reentry programs.

We believe that YPEI does inspiring and important work and that there are avenues, described above, for Yale to support this work in ways that are both responsible and sustainable. We recognize that it is up to the senior leaders of the university to determine Yale’s institutional priorities, and we understand the reality of competing demands, but we earnestly believe that the mission of YPEI connects to and extends the mission of Yale College in powerful ways, and we believe it is worthy of Yale’s support.”

Today, she said, she can report that: we are moving forward with establishing a partnership to begin to offer credits and degrees through a partner institution; we are awaiting the appointment of a faculty oversight committee as recommended by the ad hoc committee; and in the meantime, we have become an immensely valuable and beloved program for faculty, graduate students, and undergraduates.

She noted that President Salovey highlighted YPEI in his recent address to incoming Yale Graduate students in which he showed extraordinary support for this program. And in recent months, the Yale School of Art, Department of African American Studies, English Department and Theater and Performance Studies, pledged or called for support of YPEI in public statements.

Ms. Roland concluded by saying that there are four ways she feels that the FAS Senate can support YPEI as they try to grow their program and impact, increase the number of incarcerated students we can work with, increase the number of faculty who can participate, and stabilize the program at this university — and the first three are simply by ensuring that we follow the recommendations of Dean Chun’s Ad Hoc Committee:

1. By ensuring the continued ability for Yale faculty (and graduate students) to teach courses in prison through YPEI and its partnerships, and exploring avenues for the creation of a formal FAS process or initiative through which faculty can apply to teach in prison (with a long-term goal of even exploring the possibility of course release?) (**Recommendation #2**).
2. By ensuring that the Yale faculty oversight committee for YPEI be appointed as soon as possible (**Recommendation #3**).
3. By ensuring YPEI's ability to continue offering access to Yale Summer Session courses for incarcerated students, as it has since 2018 (**Recommendation #4**).
4. Advocating for meaningful further support/funding of YPEI.

Ms. Roland invited comments from two new members of the Yale Faculty, **Phillip Goff**, Professor of African American Studies and Psychology; and **Elizabeth Hinton**, Associate Professor of History and African and American studies and Professor of Law.

Philip Atiba Goff noted that his work is on racial discrimination in public safety and policing, and it is on exactly what we've been seeing this summer. He noted that it is easy for him to get up every day and understand how he translates his scholarship into something real that matters....it's much harder for many of the rest of us.

He said that if the obligation of his work is to ethics and rigor and a response we'll call inference, he said, the obligations of an educational institution right now is to the public good, and what **Ms. Roland** has produced is the national leader in prison education among higher education institutions - there's not a question around it. He noted that it is a model everywhere and the very least that Yale can do at this moment, when we're trying to understand what excellence is in the midst of concerns about the health of democracy, is for Yale to invest in the kind of excellence in prison education that it does in excellence in the rest of what it does to make good on its mission.

Elizabeth Hinton said that one of the reasons she came to Yale was for the opportunity to teach in prison through YPEI. She said that it is up to institutions like Yale to do their part in addressing what is really the most tangible expression of racial injustice in this country, and that is mass incarceration. She applauds **Ms. Roland** and YPEI for the amazing work it is doing, and she said that she is looking forward now as a Yale faculty member to continuing to ensure that that work continues to expand and flourish because it makes such a critical difference in the lives of so, so many people.

Promising that this discussion would continue at future meetings, **Mr. Jacobson** adjourned the meeting at 5:30.